DFT Study of Ca-adsorbed MoS₂ Monolayer for Hydrogen Storage Application

Archana Sharma¹, Anu¹, Mushahid Husain¹, Anurag Srivastava², Mohd. Shahid Khan^{1*}

¹Department of Physics, Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi 110025, India

²Advanced Material Research Group, CNT Lab, ABV-Indian Institute of Information Technology and Management, Gwalior 474015, India

DOI: 10.5185/amp.2018/706 www.vbripress.com/amp

Abstract

Surface metal adsorption on 2D structures is demonstrated to be an effective tool for improving hydrogen storage capacity. In the current work, the behavior of Ca atom adsorption on monolayer MoS_2 is studied and subsequently its hydrogen storage capacity is investigated computationally using van der Waals (vdW) revised Density Functional Theory. It is found that the Ca binds strongly with the MoS_2 monolayer without being clustered, leading to high hydrogen storage capacity. It is further shown that five hydrogen molecules to each Ca atom can be adsorbed with the average adsorption energy of 0.23eV per hydrogen molecule, indicating it to be a good choice for reversible adsorption/desorption of H₂ molecules at ambient conditions. It is revealed that hybridizations between s orbitals of H₂ and p orbitals of S are also responsible for adsorption mechanism, along with coulomb interactions. It is demonstrated that a steady and uniform high Ca coverage can be achieved without clustering and with enhanced binding energy which can be used as high hydrogen capacity storage system. Copyright © 2018 VBRI Press.

Keywords: Hydrogen storage, MoS₂, monolayer, adsorption, DFT, Ca.

Introduction

Due to the adverse effects of fossil fuels on the environment and their limited availability, sustainable energy sources are urgently required. Hydrogen is regarded as one of the best alternatives to such existing sources, because of its abundance, efficiency and environment friendly nature [1-5]. It possesses higher energy density than the conventional energy sources such as methane, gasoline, etc but the volumetric density of hydrogen is quite low (0.09 kg/m^3) [2, 3]. This means it requires ample amount of space for storage. Hence, the development of a stored hydrogen transporter, for e.g., fuel cell for powering vehicles has now become a global challenge. Conventional hydrogen storage systems such as liquid storage and compressed gas are inefficient and unsafe with respect from transport applications [1-4]. Hydrogen molecules adsorbed on the surface of 2D nanomaterials are gaining immense interest as an alternative energy storage system from the perspective of safety, high efficiency and fast adsorption/desorption rate. For storing hydrogen, materials should be light weight and the adsorption energies of hydrogen molecules should reside between physisorption and chemisorption energy range (0.2 eV to 0.6 eV per H_2 [2, 5]) i.e., neither too strong nor too weak so that reversible adsorption/ desorption should take place in the ambient conditions. In the recent times, materials such as carbon nanostructures, 2D Transition Metal Dichalcogenides (TMDC), BN sheets, SiC, etc are acquiring immense interest for

hydrogen storage application because of their large surface area [6, 7]. However, many theoretical studies [8, 9] have reported that they are either unable to hold the hydrogen molecules because of their chemical inertness or exhibit very low capacity hydrogen storage system by very weakly interacting with the system. Incorporation of metals on such structures makes them active for hydrogen adsorption. Alkali and alkali-earth metals are preferred over transition metals because of their lower weight and lower cohesive energies in order to avoid clustering and hence could help in achieving higher storage capacities of hydrogen [10, 11]. Further, many recent studies have shown that by decorating surface host with alkaline earth metal, particularly, Ca has larger effect on the adsorption energies than alkali metals such as Li, Na [12-17]. Moreover, Ca occurs abundantly in nature and hence it is relatively cheaper than other metals. Many carbon-based nanostructures decorated with Ca atoms are reported as hydrogen storage system but adsorption energy of H₂ molecules is not sufficient enough in such systems [18-**20**]. Although, by creating defects and by doping carbon structures with boron do facilitate hydrogen adsorption but to form such defects require large energies and concentration of impurity is also limited. Hence, lot of emphasis is now being devoted in the development of novel hydrogen storage materials. Recently, hydrogen adsorption on Li-decorated MoS₂ was investigated using first principles study [21]. They found adsorption energy above 0.20 eV/H₂ upto three H₂ molecules and for fourth and fifth molecules, energies reduced. Also, Ca adsorbed MoS_2 has been reported as promising hydrogen storage medium [22].

In the present work, large supercell of MoS₂ is modeled for the adatom-MoS₂ system. For Ca/MoS₂ system, the various trends in the geometric parameters, adsorption energies in terms of different sites, and electronic structures in terms of PDOS and charge transfer are studied based on first-principles calculations. Subsequently, hydrogen adsorption on Ca/MoS₂ system is investigated where Ca adatom acts as a primary hydrogen source and the MoS₂ monolayer as secondary. It is shown that each Ca atom can adsorb up to five hydrogen molecules, and the adsorption energy of the sixth H_2 molecule is relatively low. Our results are little different from previous reports [22] that each Ca atom can adsorb upto six H₂ molecules for single-sided Ca-decorated MoS₂ system where the height of the H₂ molecule from Ca atom and adsorption energy of the individual molecule are not considered. It is further shown that a stable and uniform coverage of Ca ions on MoS2 monolayer is possible without clustering. Thus, more adsorption sites are available for the hydrogen adsorption that can lead to high hydrogen storage capacity.

Methodology

All the calculations are carried out using Density Functional Theory, using the Vienna ab initio simulation package (VASP) [23] as implemented in medea ver 2.8.10. The generalized gradient approximation (GGA) in the form of Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof (PBE) is used to approximate exchange and correlation potential. In order to better account for the interlayer interactions, van der Waals interactions are added by means of a DFT-D2 forcefield, which adds a semi-empirical correction potential energy term to the conventional Kohn-Sham energy in the form of $\frac{C_6^{A,B}}{r_{AB}^6}$, where $C_6^{A,B}$ and r_{AB}^6 are the dispersion coefficient and distance for atoms A and B respectively [24]. Such van der waals (vdW) interactions are the origin of physisorption of gas molecules onto the surface of solid as it has been revealed in previous studies [25, 26] related to adsorption that such corrections enhances adsorption energies and our calculations have also shown the similar enhancement. A system of 3×3 supercell (including 9 Mo and 18 S atoms) is modeled, with a gamma-centered 3×3×1 k-point mesh. Periodic images of the monolayer are separated by a distance of more than 12 Å in the z-direction to avoid the interactions between them. A cutoff energy of 280 eV is employed for the plane wave expansion of wavefunctions throughout all calculations, and the system is relaxed until the forces on each atom are smaller than 0.01 eV/Å, with the convergence threshold energy of 10^{-4} eV.

Results and discussion

First, the bulk structure of MoS_2 is relaxed and the lattice constant is obtained to be 3.18Å which is quite close to the experimental one [27]. A 3×3 hexagonal supercell of

a MoS_2 monolayer is formed by applying periodic boundary conditions in x and y directions and the periodic images in the z direction are well separated by a distance of more than 12 Å to avoid interlayer interactions [Fig. 1]. Other structural parameters such as S-Mo bond length, Mo-Mo distance, and vertical S-S distance are calculated to be 2.415Å, 3.189Å and 3.127Å respectively.



Fig. 1. Schematic of 3×3 supercell MoS₂ (a) Top view (indicating the various adsorption sites for Ca in blue balls), (b) side view. Yellow and turquoise balls represent S and Mo atoms respectively.

Ca/MoS₂ system

The possible adsorption sites for a single Ca atom on MoS_2 monolayer are investigated. They are: (a) at the top site of Mo (T-site), (b) at the top site of S (S-site), (c) at the hollow center of the hexagonal ring (H-site), and (d) at the top of Mo-S bond length (B-site), as shown in **Fig. 1(a).** The adsorption energy of Ca atom on the pristine MoS_2 monolayer is defined as:

$$E_{ad} = -\left[\frac{E_{total} - nE(Ca) - E(MoS_2)}{n}\right]$$

where, E_{total} denotes the total energy of the $MoS_2 + Ca$ system, E(Ca) denotes the total energy of free Ca atom, $E(MoS_2)$ denotes total energy of the pristine MoS_2 and n denotes the number of Ca atoms adsorbed. After having the Ca atom relaxed at the B-site, it migrated to the T-site, making this site to be practically unfavorable for the adsorption. The most stable adsorption site of Ca atom is the topsite of Mo as shown in **Fig. 2(a)**, which is in accordance with the previous report [**11**, **22**], with a binding energy of 1.65eV per atom. The adsorption energies calculated with various functionals using LDA, PBE without DFT-D2 and PBE with DFT-D2 for the T-site are summarized in Table S1[†]. It can be seen that the values of adsorption energy are overestimated by LDA and underestimated by GGA-PBE exchange-correlation functional whereas PBE-vdW gives the reasonable values. All the values of E_{ad} are large enough indicating that the interaction between Ca and MoS₂ is strong and hence exhibit chemisorption nature. H-site and S-site share nearly identical adsorption energy. This shows that the diffusion barrier between them and Mo-site is quite low.The calculated adsorption energy of Ca is greater than the theoretical cohesive energy of bulk Ca atom (1.64 eV/atom [**28**]) which ensures that there is no Ca clustering. Besides, vertical distance of Ca adatom from the basal plane of sulfur atoms, d (Å), and charge transfer, Δq of Ca atom adsorbed on different sites are also presented. The smaller vertical height and larger charge transfer result in the greater adsorption energy of Ca at T-site as compared to the other sites.

As illustrated in the PDOS of the Ca/MoS₂ system [Fig. 2(b)]. It is seen that there exists a weak hybridization between Ca 3d states and S 3p state which causes an emergence of a few Ca 3d states in the PDOS. This shows that a small amount of charge is donated back to Ca from the MoS₂ layer. By Bader charge analysis [29], we find that the Ca atom transfers 1.25e charges to MoS₂ and becomes a positively charged ion. This further confirms its ionic bonding with MoS₂. Such charge transfer polarizes the system which establishes an electric field between Ca atom and MoS₂. It will be shown that the hydrogen adsorption is induced by charged Ca ion and the strength of binding depends on the amount of the transferred charge.



Fig. 2. (a) Relaxed Structure model of Ca adsorbed MoS_2 (a) Top view, (b) side view. Blue ball represents Ca atom, (b) PDOS of Ca/MoS2 system. The Fermi level is scaled to zero.

Hydrogen storage on the Ca-MoS₂ system

For studying the adsorption behavior of H_2 on the Ca-MoS₂ system, H_2 molecule is placed on different positions which are 2.0Å far from the Ca atom. Similar to the expression for the adsorption energy of a Ca-adsorbed MoS₂ layer, the average adsorption energy of H_2 molecule is given by

$$E_{ad} = -\left[\frac{E(nH_2 + Ca + MoS_2) - nE(Ca + MoS_2) - nE(H_2)}{n}\right]$$

And the adsorption energy of the nth H_2 molecule in the Ca/MoS $_2$ system is given by

$$E_{n} = -[E(nH_{2} + Ca + MoS_{2}) - E(Ca + MoS_{2} + (n - 1)H_{2}) - E(H_{2})]$$

In the case of single H_2 molecule uptake on MoS_2 with Ca atoms adsorbed on the surface indicates that the H_2 molecule seated above the hexagon in a slight tilted fashion is the most stable configuration as shown in **Fig. 3(a).** This tilt is due to the coulomb interaction between H_2 molecule and positively charged Ca ion. The distance separating the nearest H atom with the S atom is 2.94 Å which is different from the H-S bond length of 1.33Å [**30**] in the H_2S compound.

Table 1. Energetics of H₂ molecules adsorbed over Ca-MoS₂: Average adsorption energy per H₂ molecule (E_{ad}), adsorption energy of the last adsorbed H₂ molecule (E_{mth}). Along with, distance between Ca and the last added H₂ molecule (d _{Ca-nH2}), average H-H bond lengths (d _{H-H}), charge transferred by Ca to MoS₂ during H₂ adsorption (Δ q₁), and total charge transferred by Ca-MoS₂ to H₂ molecules (Δ q₂).

No. of H ₂	E _{ad}	Enth	d_{Ca-nH_2}	d _{H-H}	Δq_1	Δq_2
molecules (n)	(eV)	(eV)	(Å)	(Å)		
1	0.23		2.59	0.765	1.33e	0.04e
2	0.23	0.23	2.62	0.764	1.36e	0.06e
3	0.23	0.24	2.63	0.762	1.38e	0.07e
4	0.24	0.26	2.64	0.764	1.38e	0.15e
5	0.23	0.18	2.63	0.761	1.41e	0.13e
6	0.21	0.11	4.95	0.757	1.41e	0.15e

As shown in **Table 1**, the Ca-MoS₂ system transfers the total charge of 0.04e to the H_2 molecule during the process and average adsorption strength of the system is 0.23 eV/H_2 , which is in good agreement with the optimal energy required for H₂ sorption/desorption at ambient conditions. On further increasing the number of H₂ molecules, we find that such system can uptake the maximum of five H₂ molecules on it with average adsorption energy of 0.23 eV/H_2 as shown in Fig. 4(a). On addition of the fourth molecule leads to the enhancement in the average adsorption energy (0.24 eV)of the system and large charge transfer takes place. The adsorption strength of the fourth H_2 molecule (0.26 eV) is largest amongst the set of systems investigated, showing that such system is the most favorable adsorption configuration. Relaxed configurations of $2H_2$ to $4H_2$ adsorbed systems are shown in Fig. S1[†]. Adsorption energy of the last added H₂ molecule decreases after the addition of fourth H_2 molecule. This decrease is attributed to the crowded surface because of the small distance between neighboring H_2 molecules. But these interactions are dominated by the coulomb interaction between H_2 molecule and Ca ion on account of charge transfer of 0.03e between them at the expense of lowering of adsorption energy. The H-H bond lengths (0.761Å-0.765Å) are slightly stretched upon adsorption as compared to the isolated H_2 molecule (0.750 Å) but the molecular feature is still retained. With increasing number of H_2 molecules adsorption, Ca atom becomes more positively charged. This leads to the coulomb interactions between Ca and H_2 molecules.

To further clarify the interaction mechanism between H_2 molecule and the Ca/MoS₂, we study PDOS of $1H_2/Ca/MoS_2$ and $5H_2/Ca/MoS_2$ systems. In the former, there is weak coupling between H_2 molecules and Ca atom at -8.71 eV [Fig. 3(b)]. Due to the transfer of small charge 0.04e from Ca ion to H_2 molecule makes the neutral system of H_2 molecule polarized with a separation of charge between H_2 molecules as confirmed by Bader charge analysis i.e., one of the H_2 molecule gains 0.11e charge and becomes negatively charged while another one loses 0.07e and becomes positively charged. Since the charge transferred by the Ca ion is small, it is indeed a physisorption process. Hence, H_2 molecules interact with Ca via coulomb interactions.



Fig. 3. (a) Relaxed configuration of single H_2 adsorbed on Ca-MoS₂ system (Top view and Side view). White ball represents hydrogen atom, (b)PDOS of the H_2 adsorbed on Ca/MoS₂ system. The Fermi level is scaled to zero.

In the PDOS analysis of $5H_2/Ca/MoS_2$ system, splitting of peaks is observed in hydrogen PDOS, indicating interaction between them. Also, an orbital hybridization is observed between H₂ molecules and S atom at -9.47eV, -8.91 eV and -5.96 eV as depicted in **Fig. 4(b).** Therefore, along with coulomb interactions, hybridizations between s orbitals of H₂ molecule and p orbitals of S atom are also responsible for the adsorption mechanism.



Fig. 4(a) Relaxed structure of $5H_2/Ca/MoS_2$ system (Top view and Side view), (b) PDOS of the $5H_s$ adsorbed on Ca/MoS2 system. The Fermi level is scaled to zero.

On placing the sixth H_2 molecule on the Ca/MoS₂ system, it moves far away from the Ca ion as illustrated in **Fig. 5(a)**. It becomes more weakly bound to the system than the other H_2 molecules with adsorption energy of 0.11 eV, attributed to the repulsion from the other hydrogen molecules which are strongly bound to the system already and also the charge transferred from Ca ion to sixth H_2 molecule being almost negligible i.e., about 0.0012e. In addition, it lies perpendicular with no tilt towards Ca ion. This further confirms its extremely weak interaction nature with Ca ion. Also, since its molecular nature is retained (H-H bond length = 0.753Å), we can infer that it stays as an isolated molecule away from the system.



Fig. 5(a)Relaxed configuration of six H_2 adsorbed on Ca-MoS₂ system, (b)Relaxed configuration of full Ca coverage on MoS₂ monolayer

Ca High Coverage

For increasing the hydrogen storage capacity, the binding energies of high Ca coverage on the monolayer MoS_2 are calculated so that there can be more adsorption sites for H_2 molecule. Coverage can be defined as

Total number of Ca atoms Total number of T_Madsorption sites

Table 2 depicts that the binding energy has significantly increased on increasing the coverage and is greater than the Ca bulk cohesive energy in each case. Even at full coverage [Fig. 5(b)], the average binding energy of Ca atom (1.80 eV) is remarkably better than the 0.1 coverage (1.65 eV) though it is lesser than the 0.6 coverage (1.89 eV). There is an increase in the Ca adatom height in case of full coverage which is due to the increased repulsive interactions among positively charged Ca ions. Additionally, the Ca-Ca interaction is indeed negligible attributing to the large distance of 3.19 Å. Hence hydrogen uptake capacity can be checked at such incremented available sites for adsorption with no cluster formation and can possibly serve as a potential high capacity hydrogen storage system.

Table 2 Average adsorption energy per Ca atom (E _{ad}), and average						
Ca-Mo distances (d_{Ca-Mo}) for high coverages.						
Ca coverage	E _{ad} (eV/atom)	d _{Ca-Mo} (Å)				
0.6	1.89	3.72				
1	1.80	3.78				

Conclusion

To summarize, we report a study of Ca adsorbed MoS_2 monolayer as hydrogen storage system in terms of adsorption energy, density of states and charge transfer using Bader charge analysis. Based on density functional theory we find Ca binds strongly with pristine MoS_2 and further serves as a binding center for five H_2 molecules with a good average adsorption energy lying between the required physisorption and chemisorption energy range. Further we find that the sixth H_2 molecule is very weakly adsorbed by the system and hence lowers the average adsorption energy of the system with negligible charge transfer. We also find on increasing the Ca coverage, the binding energies have significantly increased and hence can serve as a high capacity hydrogen storage system.

Acknowledgements

The authors are thankful to Jamia Millia Islamia for providing computational facilities. One of the authors, AS, is thankful to UGC for Basic Scientific Research Fellowship.

Author's contributions

Conceived the plan: AS, ANU, MH, ASR, MSK; Performed the calculations: AS; Data analysis: AS, MSK; Wrote the paper: AS. Authors have no competing financial interests.

Supporting information

[†]Supporting informations are available from VBRI Press.

References

(a) Book Chapters

- Franzen, J.; Maus, S.; Potzel, P.Hydrogen Storage in Vehicles, In Hydrogen Science and Engineering : Materials, Processes, Systems and Technology; Stolten, D.; Emonts, B. (Eds.); Wiley: Weinheim, Germany, 2016, pp. 691-709. DOI: <u>10.1002/9783527674268.ch28</u>
- Walker, G. Hydrogen Storage technologies, In Solid-State Hydrogen Storage; Walker, G. (Eds.); Woodhead Publishing, 2008, pp. 3-17.
 DOI: 10.1533/9781845694944.frontmatter

(b) Scientific articles

- 3. Zacharia, Renju; Rather, Sami ullah; J. Nanomater., 2015, 2015, 914845
- DOI: 10.1155/2015/914845
 4. Yang, Jun; Sudik, Andrea; Wolveton, Christopher; Siegel, Donald J.; *Chem. Soc. Rev.*, 2010, 39, 656.
 DOI: 10.1039/B802882F
- Kim, Yong-Hyun; Zhao, Yufeng; Williamson, Andrew; Heben, Michael J.; Zhang, S. B.; *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, **2006**, 96, 016102.
 DOI:<u>10.1103/PhysRevLett.96.01610</u>
- Ao, Z. M.; Peeters, F. M.; *Phys. Rev. B*, **2010**, 81, 205406. DOI:<u>10.1103/PhysRevB.81.205406</u>
- Song, Nahong; Wang, Yusheng; Zheng, Yafeng; Zhang, Jing; Xu, Bin; Sun, Qiang; Jia, Yu; *Comput. Mater. Sci*, **2015**, 99, 150. **DOI**: 10.1016/j.commatsci.2014.12.016
- Koh, Eugene WaiKeong; Chiu, Cheng Hsin; Lim, Yao Kun; Zhang, Yong-Wei; Pan, Hui; Int. J. Hydrogen Energy, 2012, 37, 14323.
 DOI:10.1016/i.iibydana.2012.07.069
 - DOI:10.1016/j.ijhydene.2012.07.069
- Cabria, I; Lopez, M. J.; Alonso, J. A.; J. Chem. Phys., 2005, 123, 204721.
 DOI:10.1063/1.2125727
- Wang, Yanzong; Wang, Baolin; Huang, Rui; Zhang, Qingfang; Phys. E (Amsterdam, Neth.), 2014, 63, 276.
- DOI:10.1016/j.physe.2014.06.017
 11. Li, X. D.; Fang, Y. M.; Wu, S. Q.; Zhu, Z.Z.; *AIP Adv.*, 2015, 5, 057143
 DOI: 10.1063/1.4921564

(all metals adsorption)

- Chen, X.; Yuan, F.; Gu, Q.; Yu, X.; J. Mater. Chem. A, 2013, 1, 11705.
- **DOI:** <u>10.1039/C3TA11940H</u> 13. Gao, F.; Ding, Z.; Meng, S.; *Sci. Rep.*, **2013**, 3, 1882. **DOI:** <u>10.1038/srep01882</u>
- DOI.10.1030/Step01002
 Park, N.; Choi, K.; Hwang, J.; Kim, D. W.; Kim, D. O.; Ihm, J.; *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*, **2012**, 109, 19893.
 DOI:10.1073/pnas.1217137109
- Hussain, T.; Pathak, B.; Ramzan, M.; Maark, T. A.; Ahuja, R.; Appl. Phys. Lett., 2012, 100, 183902.
 DOI: 10.1063/1.4710526

- Sorokin, P. B.; Lee, H.; Antipina, L. Y.; Singh, A. K.; Yakobson, B. I.; *Nano Lett.*, **2011**, 11, 2660.
 DOI: <u>10.1021/nl200721y</u>
- Li, Chong; Li, Jingbo; Wu, Fengmin; Li, Shu-Shen; Xia, Jian-Bai; Wang, Lin-Wang; J. Phys. Chem. C, 2011, 115, 23221–23225.
 DOI: <u>10.1021/jp208423y</u>
- Gao, Yan; Zhao, N. Q.; Li, Jiajun; Shi, Chunsheng; Int. J. Hydrogen Energy, 2012, 37, 11835.
 DOI:10.1016/j.ijhydene.2012.05.029
- 19. Er, Suleyman; A. de Wijs, Gilles; Brocks, Geert; J. Mater. Chem. A, 2015, 3, 7710.
 POLID 10 100/04. 0 0010
- DOI:10.1039/c4ta06818a
 20. Lee, Hoonkyung; Ihm, Jisoon; Cohen, Marvin L.; Louie, Steven G.; *Nano lett.*, 2010, 10, 793.
 DOI: 10.1021/n1902822s
- Putungan, Darwin Barayang; Lin, Shi-Hsin; Wei, Ching-Ming; Kuo, Jer-Lai; *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2015, 17, 11367.
 DOI: <u>10.1039/C5CP00977D</u>
- Song, Nahong; Wang, Yusheng; Gao, Haiyang; Jiang, Weifen; Zhang, Jing; Xu, Bin; Sun, Qiang; Jia, Yu; *Phys. Lett. A*, **2015**, 379, 815.
 DOI:10.1016/j.physleta.2014.12.045
- Kresse, G.; Furthmuller, J.; *Phys. Rev. B*, **1996**, 54, 11169.
- DOI:<u>10.1103/PhysRevB.54.11169</u>
 24. Grimme, Stefan; *J. Comput. Chem.*, **2006**, 27, 1787.
 DOI:<u>10.1002/jcc.20495</u>
- Gupta, Tapan K.; *Phys. Rev. B*, **1991**, 43, 5276.
 DOI:<u>10.1103/PhysRevB.43.5276</u>
- 26. Zhao, Shijun; Xue, Jianming; Kang, Wei; *Chem. Phys. Lett.*, **2014**, 596, 35.
 - DOI:10.1016/j.cplett.2014.01.043
- Boker, Th.; Severin, R.; Muller, A.; Janowitz, C.; Manzke, R.; Voß, D.; Kruger, P.; Mazur, A.; Pollmann, J.; *Phys. Rev. B*,2001, 64, 235305.
 DOI:0.1103/PhysRevB.64.235305
- Ataca, C.; Aktürk, E.; Ciraci, S.; *Phys. Rev. B*, 2009, 79, 041406. DOI:10.1103/PhysRevB.79.041406
- Henkelman, G.; Arnaldsson, A.; Jonsson, H.; *Comput. Mater.Sci.*, 2006, 36, 354.
 - DOI:10.1016/j.commatsci.2005.04.010
- Song, Nahong; Wang , Yusheng; Ding, Songyang; Yang, Yuye; Zhang, Jing; Xu, Bin; Yi, Lin; Jia, Yu; *Vacuum*, **2015**, 117, 63. DOI: <u>10.1016/j.vacuum.2015.03.03</u>